

ANTI-CARTEL ENFORCEMENT TEMPLATE

CARTELS WORKING GROUP
Subgroup 2: Enforcement Techniques

Malaysia Competition Commission (MyCC) 7/9/2017

ICN ANTI-CARTEL ENFORCEMENT TEMPLATE

IMPORTANT NOTES:

This template is intended to provide information for the ICN member competition agencies about each other's legislation concerning (hardcore) cartels. At the same time the template supplies information for businesses participating in cartel activities about the rules applicable to them; moreover, it enables businesses which suffer from cartel activity to get information about the possibilities of lodging a complaint in one or more jurisdictions.

Reading the template is not a substitute for consulting the referenced statutes and regulations. This template should be a starting point only.

[Please include, where applicable, any references to relevant statutory provisions, regulations or policies as well as references to publicly accessible sources, if any.]¹

1. Information on the law relating to cartels		
A. Law(s) covering cartels: [availability (homepage address) and indication of the languages in which these materials are available]	A particular provision which covers cartel is section 4(2) of the Competition Act 2010 ("CA 2010"). CA 2010 is available on the MyCC's website at www.mycc.gov.my in both Malay and English.	
B. Implementing regulation(s) (if any): [name and reference number, availability (homepage address) and indication of the languages in which these materials are available]	MyCC has yet to issue any implementing regulations.	
C. Interpretative guideline(s) (if any): [name and reference number, availability	MyCC has issued six (6) Guidelines which are as follows: i. Guidelines on Complaint Procedures;	

Editor's note: all the comments in [square brackets] are intended to assist the agency when answering this template, but will be removed once the completed template is made public.

	(homepage address) and indication of the languages in	ii.	Guidelines on Market Definition;
whi	ch these materials are	iii.	Guidelines on Anti-competitive Agreement;
ava	ilable]	iv.	Guidelines on Abuse of Dominant Position;
		V.	Guidelines on Financial Penalties; and
		vi.	Guidelines on Leniency Regime.
			uidelines are published in English and available on the 's website at www.mycc.gov.my
any add lang	ner relevant materials (if v): [availability (homepage Iress) and indication of the guages in which these terials are available]	MyCC has issued some publications / materials namely handbook and brochure on cartels. These publications are available on the MyCC's website at www.mycc.gov.my .	

2. Scope and nature of prohibition on cartels

A. Does your law or case law define the term "cartel"? [Please quote.]

If not, please indicate the term you use instead. [Please quote.]

CA 2010 does not define the term "cartel".

However, Section 2 define "agreement" as any form of contract, arrangement or understanding, whether or not legally enforceable, between enterprises, and includes a decision by an association and concerted practices;

Section 2 also define "concerted practice" as any form of coordination between enterprises which knowingly substitutes practical co-operation between them for the risks of competition and includes any practice which involves direct or indirect contact or communication between enterprises, the object or effect of which is either—

- (a) to influence the conduct of one or more enterprises in a market; or
- (b) to disclose the course of conduct which an enterprise has decided to adopt or is contemplating to adopt in a market, in circumstances where such disclosure would not have been made under normal conditions of competition;

Section 4, in particular subsection (2) of CA 2010 uses the term anti-competitive practices in which "a horizontal agreement which has the object to –

- (a) fix, directly or indirectly, a purchase or selling price or any other trading conditions;
- (b) share market or sources of supply;
- (c) limit or control—
- (i) production;
- (ii) market outlets or market access;
- (iii) technical or technological development; or
- (iv) investment; or
- (d) perform an act of bid rigging,

		is deemed to have the object of significantly preventing, restricting or distorting competition in any market for goods or services."	
B.	Does your legislation or case law distinguish between very serious cartel behaviour ("hardcore cartels" – e.g.: price fixing, market sharing, bid rigging or production or sales quotas²) and other types of "cartels"? [Please describe how this differentiation is made and identify the most egregious types of conduct.]	Section 4 of CA 2010 covers prohibited horizontal and vertical agreement. Section 4(1) applies any horizontal or vertical agreement that has the object or effect of significantly preventing, restricting or distorting competition in the market. Section 4(2) of CA 2010 however emphasises only on horizontal agreement that has the object to price fix, share market, limit or control production and bid rigging to be deemed as having the object of significantly preventing, restricting or distorting competition in the market. It is clear the intention of the Parliament to consider these agreements as more serious compared to agreements which may fall under section 4(1) of CA 2010.	
C.	Scope of the prohibition of hardcore cartels: [including any exceptions, exclusions and defences e.g. for particular industries or sectors. Please also describe any other limitations to the ban on hardcore cartels.]		
D.	Is participation in a hardcore cartel illegal <i>per</i> se ³ ? [If the situation differs for civil, administrative and criminal liability, please clarify this.]	No. Section 4(2) provides a deeming provision :- "is deemed to have the object of significantly preventing, restricting, or distorting competition in any market for goods or services."	
E.	Is participation in a hardcore cartel a civil or administrative or criminal offence, or a	It is considered as a civil offence.	

In some jurisdictions these types of cartels – and possibly some others – are regarded as particularly serious violations. These types of cartels are generally referred to as "hardcore cartels". Hereinafter this terminology is used.

³ For the purposes of this template the notion of 'per se' covers both 'per se' and 'by object', as these terms are synonyms used in different jurisdictions.

3. Investigating institution(s)

A. Name of the agency, which investigates cartels: [if there is more than one agency, please describe the allocation of responsibilities]

Malaysia Competition Commission (MyCC)

Malaysian Aviation Commission (MAVCOM)

Malaysian Communications and Multimedia Commission (MCMC)

Energy Commission (EC)

B. Contact details of the agency: [address, telephone and fax including the country code, email, website address and languages available on the website]

Malaysia Competition Commission (MyCC)

Level 15, Menara SSM @Sentral, 7 Jalan Stesen Sentral 5, Kuala Lumpur Sentral, 50623 Kuala Lumpur, MALAYSIA

Tel: +603-2273 2277
Fax: +603-2272 2293 / 1692
Email: enquiries[at]mycc.gov.my
Website: www.mycc.gov.my

Malaysian Aviation Commission (MAVCOM)

Level 19, Menara 1 Sentrum 201 Jalan Tun Sambanthan 50470 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Tel: +603 2772 0600

Consumer hotline: +603 2772 0677

Email: competition@mavcom.my / enquiries@mavcom.my

Website: http://www.mavcom.my

Malaysian Communications and Multimedia Commission (MCMC)

MCMC Tower 1 Jalan Impact Cyber 6 63000 Cyberjaya Selangor Darul Ehsan Malaysia

Tel: +60 3 8688 8000 Fax: +60 3 8688 1000 Email: scd@cmc.gov.my Website: www.mcmc.gov.my

Energy Commission (EC)

No. 12, Jalan Tun Hussein Precinct 2, 62100, Putrajaya.

		Tel: 03-8870 8500 Fax: 03-8888 8637
C.	Information point for potential complainants:	MyCC has issued Guidelines on Complaint Procedures which contain information that may be useful for potential complainants.
D.	Contact point where complaints can be lodged:	Complaints can be lodged with the MyCC via email, post, fax or walk in.
E.	Are there other authorities which may assist the investigating agency? If yes, please name the authorities and the type of assistance they provide.	No.

4. Decision-making institution(s)⁴ [to be filled in only if this is different from the investigating agency]

Α.	Name of the agency making
	decisions in cartel cases: [if
	there is more than one
	agency, please describe the
	allocation of responsibilities.
	·

Competition Appeal Tribunal

B. Contact details of the agency: [address, telephone and fax including the country code, email, website address and languages available on the website]

Competition Appeal Tribunal

Aras 9 (Menara), No 13 Persiaran Perdana, Presint 2, Pusat Pentadbiran Kerajaan Persekutuan, 62623 Putrajaya, Malaysia

Tel: 03-88826452 Fax: 03-88826193

Email: webmastertrp@kpdnkk.gov.my
Website: http://trp.kpdnkk.gov.my./

C. Contact point for questions and consultations:

N/a

D. Describe the role of the investigating agency in the process leading to the sanctioning of the cartel conduct.

The Competition Appeal Tribunal may confirm or set aside the decision which is the subject of the appeal, or any part of it, and may:-

- remit the matter to the Competition Commission of Malaysia;
- ii. impose or revoke, or vary the amount of, a financial penalty:

Meaning: institution taking a decision on the merits of the case (e.g. prohibition decision, imposition of fine, etc.)

	iii. iv.	give such direction, or take such other step as the Competition Commission of Malaysia could itself have given or taken; or make any other decision which the Competition Commission of Malaysia could itself have made.
E. What is the role of the investigating agency if cartel cases belong under criminal proceedings?	N/a	

5.	5. Handling complaints and initiation of proceedings		
A.	Basis for initiating investigations in cartel cases: [complaint, ex officio, leniency application, notification, etc.]	MyCC can initiate an investigation upon receipt of a complaint, ex officio conduct or upon a ministrial direction.	
В.	Are complaints required to be made in a specific form (e.g. by phone, in writing, on a form, etc.)? [If there is a requirement to complete a specific form, please, indicate its location (website address).]	Yes. The complaint form is available on the MyCC's website at www.mycc.gov.my . However, complaints can also be made without fill in the form.	
C.	Legal requirements for lodging a complaint against a cartel: [e.g. is legitimate interest required, or is standing to make a complaint limited to certain categories of complainant?]	According to Section 15(2) of CA2010, the complaint shall specify the person against whom the complaint is made and details of the alleged infringement or offence under this Act.	
D.	Is the investigating agency obliged to take action on each complaint that it receives or does it have discretion in this respect? [Please elaborate.]	No. The MyCC will have to carry out its assessment on whether the complaint has merits and decide whether or not to further assess the complaint received.	
E.	If the agency intends not to pursue a complaint, is it required to adopt a decision addressed to the complainant explaining its reasons?	According to Section 16(2), in the event where the MyCC decides not to investigate, it has to inform the complainant on its decision and reasons for the decision.	
F.	Is there a time limit counted from the date of receipt of a complaint by the competition agency for taking the decision on whether to investigate or reject it?	No.	

6. Leniency policy⁵	
A. What is the official name of your leniency policy (if any)? [Please indicate its public availability.]	Leniency regime as stipulated under section 41 of CA 2010. The MyCC has issued Guidelines on Leniency Regime which is available on the MyCC's website at www.mycc.gov.my.
B. Does your jurisdiction offer full leniency as well as partial leniency (i.e. reduction in the sanction / fine), depending on the case?	Yes, based on marker system.
C. Who is eligible for full leniency [only for the first one to come forward or for more participants in the cartel]?	The applicant has admitted its involvement in a cartel and offers to provide information or other form of cooperation about the same cartel which the MyCC has no knowledge. Notwithstanding the above, the MyCC reserves the right to give reduction up to 100% in other circumstances.
D. Is eligibility for leniency dependent on the enforcing agency having either no knowledge of the cartel or insufficient knowledge of the cartel to initiate an investigation?	Yes.
In this context, is the date (the moment) at which participants in the cartel come forward with information (before or after the opening of an investigation) of any relevance for the outcome of leniency applications?	Yes.
E. Who can be a beneficiary of the leniency program (individual / businesses)?	Enterprises (businesses).
F. What are the conditions of availability of full leniency: [e.g. provide decisive evidence, maintain cooperation throughout, not to be the ringleader, cease the infringement, restitution, etc.]	Admission of its involvement in an infringement of Section 4(2) prohibition and provision of information and or cooperation which significantly assisted or is likely to assist in the identification or investigation of any finding of an infringement.
G. What are the conditions of	Depending on the stage of the investigation, the nature and the

For the purposes of this template the notion of 'leniency' covers both full leniency and a reduction in the sanction or fines. Moreover, for the purposes of this template terms like 'leniency' 'amnesty' and 'immunity' are considered as synonyms.

	availability of partial leniency (such as reduction of sanction / fine / imprisonment): [e.g.: valuable, potential, decisive evidence by witnesses or on basis of written documents, etc.? Must the information be sufficient to lead to an initiation of investigations?]	value-added of the information as well as other cooperation provided by the leniency applicant.
Н.	Obligations for the beneficiary after the leniency application have been accepted: [e.g. ongoing, full cooperation with the investigating agency during the proceedings, etc.]	Full cooperation is expected throughout the investigation process.
I.	Are there formal requirements to make a leniency application? [e.g. must applications take a particular form or include particular information/data, must they be in writing or can they be made orally, etc.]	An application can be made by submitting the completed leniency application form unless authorised by the MyCC and signed by an authorised senior officer of the leniency applicant.
J.	Are there distinct procedural steps within the leniency program? [e.g.: provisional guarantee of leniency ("PGL") and further steps leading to a final leniency agreement / decision)?]	Yes. The grant is initially for conditional leniency and will only be made unconditional only after the applicant has fulfilled all conditions of the conditional grant of leniency and the MyCC has made an infringement decision.
K.	At which time during the application process is the applicant given certainty with respect to its eligibility for leniency, and how is this done?	If upon request the Leniency Officer advises that leniency is available, the applicant may ask for a marker to preserve its priority.
L.	What is the legal basis for the power to agree to grant leniency? Is leniency granted on the basis of an agreement or is it laid down in a (formal) decision? Who within the agency decides about leniency applications?	Under Section 41 of CA2010, the Commission decides on leniency applications.
M.	Do you have a marker system? If yes, please describe it.	Yes. The Leniency Officer is authorised by the MyCC to provide a marker to the applicant. In requesting a marker, the applicant shall the name of the enterprise(s) that will be covered by the leniency and sufficient details to identify the infringement. The Leniency Officer will consequently give a marker to the applicant. A written confirmation of the marker will be provided by the Leniency Officer thereafter. A marker is valid for 30 days from the date it is granted.

N. Does the system provide for any extra credit ⁶ for disclosing additional violations? [e.g. a hardcore cartel in another market]	Yes.
O. Is the agency required to keep the identity of the beneficiary confidential? If yes, please elaborate.	Confidentiality including the identity of the applicant will be maintained subject to Section 21 of CA2010.
P. Is there a possibility of appealing an agency's decision rejecting a leniency application?	No.
Q. Contact point where a leniency application can be lodged [telephone and fax including the country code, plus out of hours contacts (if any)]:	Malaysia Competition Commission Level 15, Menara SSM @Sentral, 7 Jalan Stesen Sentral 5, Kuala Lumpur Sentral, 50623 Kuala Lumpur, MALAYSIA Tel: +603-2273 2277 Fax: +603-2272 2293 / 1692 Email: enquiries[at]mycc.gov.my Website: www.mycc.gov.my The Leniency Officer will answer call from 8.30 a.m. to 5.30 p.m.
R. Does the policy address the possibility of leniency being revoked? If yes, describe the circumstances where revocation would occur. Can an appeal be made against a decision to revoke leniency?	Yes. The MyCC may revoke a conditional grant of leniency if it concludes that the applicant has not fulfilled any condition such as by providing false or misleading information to the MyCC.
S. Does your policy allow for "affirmative leniency", that is the possibility of the agency approaching potential leniency applicants?	N/A.
T. Does your authority have rules to protect leniency material from disclosure? If yes, please elaborate.	No.

Also known as: "leniency plus", "amnesty plus" or "immunity plus". This category covers situations where a leniency applicant, in order to get as lenient treatment as possible in a particular case, offers to reveal information about participation in another cartel distinct from the one which is the subject of its first leniency application.

7.	Settlement	
Α.	Does your competition regime allow settlement?	N/A.
	If yes, please indicate its public availability (link to the relevant rules, guidelines, etc.].	
В.	Which types of restrictive agreements are eligible for settlement [e.g. hardcore cartels, other types of cartels, vertical agreements only]?	N/A.
C.	What is the reward of the settlement for the parties?	N/A.
D.	May a reduction for settling be cumulated with a leniency reward?	N/A.
E.	List the criteria (if there is any) determining the cases which are suitable for settlement.	N/A.
F.	Describe briefly the system [who can initiate settlement – your authority or the parties, whether your authority is obliged to settle if the parties initiate, in which stage of the investigation settlement may be initiated, etc.].	N/A.
F.	Describe the procedural efficiencies of your settlement system [e.g. shorter decision, etc.].	N/A.
G.	Does a settlement necessitate that the parties acknowledge their liability for the violation?	N/A.
Н.	Is there a possibility for settled parties to appeal a settlement decision at court?	N/A.

8. Commitment	
A. Does your competition	Yes. The provision relating to undertaking is enshrined under

regime allow the possibility of commitment?	Section 43 of CA2010.
If yes, please indicate its public availability [link to the relevant rules, guidelines, etc.].	
B. Which types of restrictive agreements are eligible for commitment [e.g. hardcore cartels, other types of cartels, vertical agreements only]?	Section 43 of CA2010 is applicable for all types of infringement.
Are there commitments which are excluded from the commitment possibility?	
C. List the criteria (if there are any) determining the cases which are suitable for commitment.	N/A.
D. Describe, which types of commitments are available under your competition law.[e.g.: behavioural / structural]	The MyCC may impose any conditions on any enterprise to do or refrain from doing as the MyCC considers appropriate.
E. Describe briefly the system [who can initiate commitment – your authority or the parties, in which stage of the investigation commitment may be initiated, etc.]	Initiation can be done by the MyCC or by the enterprise.
I. Does a commitment decision necessitate that the parties acknowledge their liability for the violation?	No.
J. Describe how your authority monitors the parties' compliance to the commitments.	The MyCC will monitor from time to time.
K. Is there a possibility for parties to appeal a commitment decision at court?	No.

9. Investigative powers of the enforcing institution(s)⁷

A. Briefly describe the investigative measures available to the enforcing agency such as requests for information, searches/raids⁸, electronic or computer searches, expert opinion, etc. and indicate whether such measures requires a court warrant.

The MyCC has the power to require provision of information, conduct search with or without warrant, have access to computerised data and have access to records etc.

B. Can private locations, such as residences, automobiles, briefcases and persons be searched, raided or inspected? Does this require authorisation by a court?

Yes. Search can be conducted on any premise that has been used or contains evidence which may assist the MyCC's investigation. Search can also be conducted on any computer, automobiles and briefcases as well as person. A search warrant may not be required in the event that adverse affect will happen on the MyCC's investigation or evidence will be tampered with or removed.

C. May evidence not falling under the scope of the authorisation allowing the inspection be seized / used as evidence in another case? If yes, under which circumstances (e.g. is a post-search court warrant needed)?

N/A.

D. Have there been significant legal challenges to your use of investigative measures authorized by the courts? If yes, please briefly describe them.

No.

10. Procedural rights of businesses / individuals

A. Key rights of defence in cartel cases: [e.g.: right of access to documents in the possession of the enforcing authority, right to a written statement of the case against the defendant, right to respond to that case in

According to Section 36 and Section 37 of CA2010, upon being served with Proposed Decision, enterprises may submit their written representations and make oral representations before the MyCC.

⁷ "Enforcing institutions" may mean either the investigating or the decision-making institution or both.

^{8 &}quot;Searches/raids" means all types of search, raid or inspection measures.

_		
	writing, right to respond orally, right to confront companies or individuals that make allegations against the defendant, right to legal representation before the enforcing authorities, right not to self-incriminate, etc.] Please indicate the relevant legal provisions.	
	B. Protection awarded to business secrets (competitively sensitive information): is there a difference depending on whether the information is provided under a compulsory legal order or provided under informal co-operation? Please indicate the relevant legal provisions.	Protection awarded to business secrets is subject to Section 21 CA2010.

11. Limitation periods and deadlines		
A. What is the limitation period (if any) from the date of the termination of the infringement by which the investigation / proceedings must begin or a decision on the merits of the case must be made?	No limitation period.	
B. What is the deadline, statutory or otherwise (if any) for the completion of an investigation or to make a decision on the merits?	N/A.	
C. What are the deadlines, statutory or otherwise (if any) to challenge the commencement or completion of an investigation or a decision regarding sanctions? (see also 15A)	N/A.	

12. Types of decisions

- A. List which types of decisions on the merits of the case can be made in cartel cases under the laws listed under Section 1. [E.g.: finding of an infringement, ordering to bring the infringement to an end, imposition of fines, etc.]
- (i) Finding of an infringement;
- (ii) Requirement for the infringement to be ceased immediately;
- (iii) Direction for steps to be taken for bringing the infringement to an end;
- (iv) Imposition of a financial penalty; and
- (v) Any other direction as the MyCC deems appropriate.
- B. List any other types of decisions on the merits of the case relevant particularly in hardcore cartel cases under the laws listed under Section 1 (if different from those listed under 12/A).

Refer to the above.

C. Can interim measures be ordered during the proceedings in cartel cases? (if different measures for hardcore cartels please describe both 10.) Which institution (the investigatory / the decision-making one) is authorised to take such decisions? What are the conditions for taking such a decision?

Yes. The MyCC has the power to direct an interim measure if it has grounds to believe that any prohibition under CA 2010 has been infringed or is likely to be infringed and it considers that it is necessary for it to act as a matter of urgency to prevent serious and irreparable damage, economic or otherwise, to a particular person or category of persons; or protecting the public interest.

13. Sanctions for procedural breaches (non-compliance with procedural obligations) in the course of investigations

A. Grounds for the imposition of procedural sanctions / fines

[e.g. late provision of requested information, false or incomplete provision of information, lack of notice, lack of disclosure, obstruction of justice, destruction of evidence, challenging the validity of documents authorizing

N/A.

In some jurisdictions, in cases of urgency due to the risk of serious and irreparable damage to competition, either the investigator or the decision-making agency may order interim measures prior to taking a decision on the merits of the case [e.g.: by ordering the immediate termination of the infringement].

¹⁰ Only for agencies which answered "yes" to question 2.B. above

	investigative measures, etc.]:	
B.	Type and nature of the sanction (civil, administrative, criminal, combined; pecuniary or other):	N/A.
C.	On whom can procedural sanctions be imposed?	N/A.
D.	Criteria for determining the sanction / fine:	N/A.
E.	Are there maximum and / or minimum sanctions / fines?	N/A.

14. Sanctions on the merits of the case A. Type and nature of sanctions Civil and against enterprises. in cartel cases (civil, administrative, criminal, combined): On whom can sanctions be imposed? [E.g.: representatives of businesses, (imprisonment for individuals), businesses, in the case of associations of companies the associations or the individual companies?] B. Criteria for determining the (i) Seriousness (gravity) of the infringement; sanction / fine: [e.g.: gravity, (ii) Duration of the infringement; duration of the violation, benefit gained from the (iii) Impact of the infringement; violation] (iv) Degree of fault (negligence/intention); (v) Role of the enterprise in the infringement; (vi) Recidivism; (vii) Existence of a compliance programme; and (viii) Level of financial penalties imposed. C. Are there maximum and / or Yes. A financial penalty imposed shall not exceed ten percent minimum sanctions / fines? of the worldwide turnover of an enterprise over the period during which an infringement occurred. D. Guideline(s) on calculation of The MyCC has issued Guidelines on Financial Penalties in fines: [name and reference English which is available on the MyCC's website at http://mycc.gov.my/sites/default/files/handbook/Guildline-onnumber, availability (homepage address) and Financial-Penalties.pdf indication of the languages in

which these materials are

á	available]	
() () () () ()	Does a challenge to a decision imposing a sanction / fine have an automatic suspensory effect on that sanction / fine? If it is necessary to apply for suspension, what are the criteria?	No. Section 53 of CA2010 states that pending decision of an appeal by the Competition Appeal Tribunal, a decision of the Commission shall be valid, binding and enforceable except where a stay of the decision has been applied for by the appellant and granted by the Competition Appeal Tribunal.

15. Possibilities of appeal

A. Does your law provide for an appeal against a decision that there has been a violation of a prohibition of cartels? If yes, what are the grounds of appeal, such as questions of law or fact or breaches of procedural requirements?

Yes. Section 51 of CA2010 allows an appeal to be made by an aggrieved person whose interest is affected by the MyCC's decision issued under Section 35 (interim measures), Section 39 (finding of a non-infringement) and Section 40 (finding of an infringement).

B. Before which court or agency should such a challenge be made? [if the answer to question 15/A is affirmative]

Before the Competition Appeal Tribunal.